

Worked Examples 301-303

IC feature(s) in focus	
Concise checklist	3. Negotiate towards a common decision k) Language: evaluating, comparing, prioritising points Feedback: don't simply describe...Try to summarise, evaluate or compare, or narrow down the options
Full checklist	4. Negotiate towards a common decision

Example 301: P05

(The transcript below shows an excerpt towards the end of the discussion task. However, it is best to get students to watch the whole 3-minute interaction. One will notice that the candidates describe and occasionally evaluate each idea, but they don't prioritise or compare different ideas, as an examiner commented.)

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CvWuwnHc12s> (02:55)

Task: Here're some pictures which show people helping others in different ways. First, talk to each other about what kind of help the people are giving. Then decide who needs help most.

(Towards the end of the discussion time)

1. C: They need always a [person close to them
2. L: [Yes yes I agree
3. C: simply to get in a train or to get out.
4. ((pause))
5. L: Yes. And in this picture, we can see a- mm
6. C: A group of people sitting in a [in a boat in the middle of
7. the strait
8. L: [XXX and they've had
9. C: but surrounded by [water
10. L: [water
11. C: Yeah
12. L: They've had a float, annnd it's really important then-
13. this- that- this- uh man can help them
14. because maybeee on their own they mm couldn't survive
15. C: Exactly
16. Int: Thank you.

Guiding questions

- Consider the extract (lines 1-16) above and the whole discussion. Do you think C and L have addressed both parts of the task?
 - (They have partly addressed part 1 of the task – what kinds of help the people are giving, but they have not address part 2 – decide who needs help the most.)
- In discussing each idea/picture, what do C and J do? And what have they not done? (Hint: in relation to addressing part 2)
 - (They describe the picture, e.g. lines 5-12, and occasionally evaluate how important the kind of help is, e.g. lines 12-14. However, they don't compare and prioritise the ideas, steering the discussion towards a joint decision of who needs help the most. Consequently, even at the end of the discussion time (lines 12-16), they are still talking about individual ideas and there is no sense of coming to a decision.)
- Look at Example 302 below and compare the way the ideas are discussed in the two examples.

#DontJustDescribe
#WorkTowardsADecision

Example 302: P04

(simplified transcript)

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jPepPA6KJ0Q> (01:45)

Task: Imagine that some new houses have been built. The people living there want to get to know each other, so they are organizing a special event. Discuss how these ideas would help people to get to know each other, then decide which idea would be the most successful.

1. D: Yes, of course. And yeah, what do you think about uhm
2. the orchestra, just like, do a concert?
3. S: Well I think it's uh similar to this picture
4. because, I think that's a good idea to make the people
5. get together but- not the player, uh but player uh
6. but they'll- they're just sitting and watching the-
7. D: Yeah and they're just- in the middle there
8. just focus on the song or player
9. S: Yeah
10. D: Then the new people you'd like to invite are just sitting
11. there and, nobody is talking, just listen to the music
12. S: Yeah yeah
13. D: So, I agree with you that it's not the best idea.
14. S: yeah

Guiding questions

- At lines 1-2, D initiates discussion of the idea of having a concert. He asks what S thinks about the idea. Look at the answer by S (lines 3-7). What do you think her view is?
 - *(S partly agrees that it's a good idea (lines 4-5), but she also has reservations (lines 6-7) about it.)*
- Can you notice something special about the way S comments on the idea? How is that different from the way C and L talk about ideas in Example 301?
 - *(S compares the concert idea with another idea they have discussed before – sports game ('similar to this picture', line 3), and says that they share a disadvantage – the people just sit there and watch the game/concert, without talking to one another.)*
 - *(Difference from Example 301: D and S compare the ideas, not just describe and evaluate them individually.)*
- How does D develop the idea further (lines 8-14)?
 - *(D picks up on the disadvantage S mentions that the people are just 'sitting and watching' (line 6-7), and elaborates on its consequence – 'nobody is talking, just listening to the music' (line 12). He then gives a final evaluation that 'it's not the best idea' (line 14).)*
- What have D and S achieved together in relation to part 2 of the task?
 - *(Together, they have compared different ideas (e.g. 'similar to', line 3) and narrowed down the list by eliminating some of the ideas (line 14), steering the discussion towards making a decision. 'I agree with you that it's not the best idea' by D (line 14) also indicates that they have come to a consensus about an idea, a step towards a joint decision.)*

#Don'tJustDescribe
#DevelopPartnersIdea

Example 303: P04 continued

(The transcript shows the discussion of another idea immediately following the previous one in Example 302.)

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jPepPA6KJ0Q> (02:24)

15. D: And uhm what- we have here gar[dening?
16. I don't know, maybe it's a little bit boring because uhm
17. each other or, different people are doing this and the
18. other are doing that, so, I don't know,
19. what do you think?
20. S: But they can help each other to plant in the plant and
21. D: in the garden
22. S: Yeah
23. D: Yeah! So I think this one is is better than the music
24. and the [the sport
25. S: [Yeah because they have chance to talking about the
26. plants, yeah plants

Guiding questions

- What does D do in talking about the idea of gardening (lines 16-20)?
 - (D gives a negative evaluation of the idea – 'a little bit boring' (line 17) and gives reasons for his opinion (lines 17-19). He then asks what S thinks about the idea (line 19).)
- What does S say about the idea at line 21?
 - (Beginning with 'but', S presents an advantage of the idea – that people would have a chance to help each other, therefore turning the trajectory from a negative evaluation of the idea to a positive one.)
- Do you think S has a positive or negative view about the idea? What evidence do we have?
 - (1. At line 21, S presents an advantage of the idea, and the linking word 'but' indicates a contrast with what D has said. 2. Looking at D's next turn at line 24, he has actually changed his view towards the idea to a positive one. This shows that he understands what S says at line 21 as indicating a positive view.)
- If you were the examiner, do you think D and S have worked towards a joint decision here?
 - (At lines 24-25, D compares and weighs the ideas, saying the gardening idea is better than the concert and the sports game ideas they have discussed before. S comes in at lines 26-27 agreeing with D's evaluation, referring to and reinforcing the main criterion they have been establishing throughout the discussion – opportunity for people to talk to each other.)

#WorkTowardsADecision

#GiveReasons

#DevelopOwnIdeas

Lesson learned

The discussion will not come to a joint decision and address part 2 of the task (e.g. decide which idea is the best / most important) if we only describe the pictures and saying they are good/bad ideas individually (see Example 301). As we have seen in Examples 302-303, D and S evaluate and compare the different ideas (e.g. this one is better than the last two), bringing their discussion towards the direction of making a decision together.

In addition, asking your partner questions such as 'which one do you prefer?' or 'which one should we go for?' would also be useful in working towards a decision.